

**Delegated or Committee Planning Application Report and Report of handling as required by Schedule 2 of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Scotland) Regulations 2008 relative to applications for Planning Permission or Planning Permission in Principle**

---

**Reference No:** 11/01066/MFF  
**Planning Hierarchy:** Local Development  
**Applicant:** Lakeland Marine Farms Ltd.  
**Proposal:** Relocation of Ardmaddy fish farm - comprising 12 No. 100m circumference cages plus installation of feed barge  
**Site Address:** Port Na Morachd, Seil Sound

---

**SUPPLEMENTARY REPORT No.1**

---

**(A) BACKGROUND**

This report details a consultation response from Historic Scotland along with additional representations received beyond those considered in the report to the meeting of the 20<sup>th</sup> March 2013. Those reported below bring the total number of objectors to 816 and the number of supporters to 44, plus 2 neutral representations.

**(B) ADDITIONAL CONSULTATION RESPONSE**

**Historic Scotland** (letters dated 17.04.13 and 28.02.13) – are of the view that the proposal has the potential to have a high visual impact upon the setting of Dun Fadaidh (750m WNW of Degnish) but does not consider that this impact is sufficient to warrant an objection on their behalf. The scheduled dun is located 350m SE of the proposed fish farm. It was deliberately placed so as to command extensive views up and down the seaway. The presence of the fish farm within the setting of the monument could potentially be improved by relocation further to the north.

**Scottish Wildlife Trust** (e-mail dated 17.04.13) – remain critical of the fact that a full Environmental Impact Assessment was not required to accompany this application. *Comment: The matter was the subject of a screening request in advance of the application by the applicants and a negative screening opinion by the Council following consultation with relevant consultees.* It is considered that the use of ADD's to scare seals would disturb cetaceans contrary to European conservation interests. In their opinion, the effect upon the marine environment and the SAC has been under-estimated by SEPA in their 'appropriate assessment' and in the face of 'reasonable scientific doubt' about the extent of environmental effects, SEPA ought not to have licenced the site. *Comment: the CAR licensing process is a separate consent regime, subject to public comment, and their decision is a matter of record and not a material planning consideration.* Fish farming employment should not be at the expense of wildlife tourism which provides peak summer employment for 25 to 30 people locally whose livelihood would be affected by the exclusion of seals, dolphins and porpoises.

## **(C) FURTHER REPRESENTATIONS**

### **Objectors**

Mr G Birse, 15 Hawcraig Road, Aberdour (e-mail dated 06.04.13)  
Mr J Harrop, The Manse, 10 The Chipping, Tetbury (e-mail dated 06.04.13)  
Mr J Prince, 10 Rose Street, Nairn (e-mail dated 05.04.13)  
Mrs J Brooke, Merricks Farm, Park Lane, Langport (e-mail dated 14.03.13)

These representations do not raise substantive matters beyond those grounds of objection summarised in the main report.

### **Supporters**

Mr D Wood, 4 Rowan Drive, Tain (e-mail dated 05.04.13)  
Mr A Robb, Cuillipool, Isle of Luing (Letter dated 28.03.13)  
Ms S Cameron, Eriador, Carradale (e-mail dated 28.03.13)  
Mr P Roberts, Ri Port, Monydrain Road, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 19.03.13)  
Mr A Manson, 3 MacMillan Court, Ardrishaig (e-mail dated 25.3.12)  
Mrs H Wilson, Inverlussa, Craignure (e-mail dated 20.03.13)  
Mr C Charwood, Riverside Filling Station, Oban Road, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 20.03.13)  
Mr J Lockhart, 28 Wemyss Avenue, Newton Mearns, Glasgow (e-mail dated 20.03.13)  
Mr G MacPhail, 1 Kilmartin, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 20.03.13)  
Mr D MacMillan, 6 Culfail Cottages, Kilmelford (e-mail dated 20.03.13)  
Ms E Kemp, Ri Port, Monydrain Road, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 19.03.13)  
Mr A Geddes, 11 Duntrune Place, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 20.03.13)  
Mr D Wilson, Inverlussa, Craignure (e-mail dated 19.03.13)  
Mr D Moller, 2 Lagnagortan, Clachan, by Tarbert (e-mail dated 19.03.13)  
Mr G McNaughton, Site 20 Kilmory Industrial Estate, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 19.03.13)  
Mr A Fraser, Bousd, Isle of Coll (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr R Fyfe, 3 Clydesdale Buildings, Argyll Street, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr S Blair, 36 Morvern Hill, Oban (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Ms L Macleod, 36 Morvern Hill, Oban (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr J Young, Tormod, Laggan Wood, Kilmartin (e-mail dated 19.03.13)  
Mr J Triscott, 43 Cowane Street, Stirling (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr S Lafferty, 32 Glengarry Crescent, Falkirk (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr J Hendrie, 19 Main Street, Brightons, Falkirk (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr I Keen-Smith, 9 Meadow Road, Dunbeg, Oban (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Ms S Clark, 33 New Holygate, Broxburn (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr J Liddel, 11 Calder Place, hallglen, Falkirk (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Ms L Starrs, 23 Forrester Road, Armadale (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr R McCormick, 9 Monkland Road, Bathgate (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr E Cameron, 42 Sidey Place, Perth (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr J Christie, 23 Maxwell Street, Edinburgh (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Ms K Mcleod, 18 Kennoway Crescent, Hamilton (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr D Low, 114 Dalnabay, Aviemore (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr K Robertson, 6 Duntrune Place, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr I Webster, Halladale, Kilmory Road, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Dr L Pollock, 6 Duntrune Place, Lochgilphead (e-mail dated 18.03.13)  
Mr A Young, Snowdrop Cottage, Furnace (e-mail dated 15.03.13)

These representations do not raise substantive matters beyond those grounds of support summarised in the main report, with the exception of the following:

- A Carradale resident has written to confirm that that Meridian Salmon Farm established in the Kilbrannon Sound has not deterred basking sharks or whales and has afforded shelter for other visiting species such as eider ducks. The site does not produce nuisance from lighting or from noise or detract from the amenity of the village;
- Relocation will see reduced visual impact with the use of fewer black cages in a location further from sight of anyone on land;
- The applicants are a respected operator who have sound environmental policies, provide local employment and who are active in supporting the local community;
- Fish farming is an important employer in Argyll directly employing over 500 people and with a 17% increase in 2012. The applicants already employ 54 people and contribute over £4m to the local economy through wages, suppliers services and processing.

**Corrections**

Mr H Middleton and Ms J Fowler (recorded as objectors) have written upon receipt of notifications of the committee meeting to confirm that they are not the originators of the representations attributed to them and that they have no interest in the application.

**(D) RECOMMENDATION**

It is recommended that permission be granted subject to the conditions and reasons listed in the original report.

<b>Author of Report:</b>	Richard Kerr	<b>Date:</b>	19 <sup>th</sup> April 2013
<b>Angus Gilmour Head of Planning and Regulatory Services</b>			